

Central Florida Trial Lawyers Association 2019 Judicial Survey Results

Judge	Assignment	Legal Knowledge	Impartiality	Demeanor	Diligence	Average
Alvaro	Circuit - 9 th (Orange)	4.29 (n=41)	4.45 (n=40)	4.69 (n=42)	4.50 (n=38)	4.48
Rodriguez	Circuit - 9 th (Orange)	4.33 (n=30)	4.39 (n=28)	4.57 (n=28)	4.46 (n=28)	4.44
Carsten	Circuit - 9 th (Orange)	4.37 (n=51)	4.49 (n=51)	4.71 (n=49)	4.43 (n=49)	4.50
Leblanc	Circuit - 9 th (Orange)	4.39 (n=80)	4.54 (n=80)	4.68 (n=79)	4.32 (n=79)	4.50
Murphy	Circuit - 9 th (Osceola)	4.45 (n=38)	4.57 (n=37)	4.63 (n=38)	4.59 (n=37)	4.56
Roche	Circuit - 9 th (Orange)	4.24 (n=63)	3.75 (n=64)	3.16 (n=64)	4.00 (n=64)	3.79
Higbee	Circuit - 9 th (Orange)	4.38 (n=79)	4.35 (n=78)	4.61 (n=79)	4.39 (n=77)	4.43
Weiss	Circuit - 9 th (Orange)	4.90 (n=91)	4.85 (n=92)	4.92 (n=91)	4.81 (n=90)	4.87
Allen	County – 9 th (Orange)	3.48 (n=44)	3.58 (n=43)	3.56 (n=43)	3.51 (n=41)	3.58
DuBois	County – 9 th (Orange)	4.40 (n=42)	4.62 (n=42)	4.70 (n=43)	4.40 (n=42)	4.53
Johnson	County – 9 th (Orange)	4.10 (n=21)	4.43 (n=23)	4.29 (n=21)	4.19 (n=21)	4.25
Adams	County – 9 th (Orange)	3.93 (n=29)	4.27 (n=30)	4.31 (n=29)	4.00 (n=29)	4.12
Schreiber	Circuit – 9 th (Orange)	3.42 (n=65)	3.29 (n=66)	3.71 (n=65)	3.41 (n=64)	3.45
Epperson	County – 9 th (Osceola)	3.25 (n=8)	2.89 (n=9)	3.22 (n=9)	3.60 (n=10)	3.24
Galluzzo	Circuit-18 th (Seminole)	4.50 (n=46)	4.40 (n=47)	4.54 (n=46)	4.46 (n=46)	4.47
Rudisill	Circuit-18 th (Seminole)	4.48 (n=69)	4.54 (n=69)	4.51 (n=69)	4.30 (n=70)	4.45
Stacy	Circuit-18 th (Seminole)	4.21 (n=29)	4.30 (n=30)	4.45 (n=29)	4.31 (n=29)	4.32
Recksiedler	Circuit-18 th (Seminole)	4.31 (n=70)	4.23 (n=69)	4.26 (n=69)	4.24 (n=68)	4.26
Krause	County-18 th (Seminole)	3.83 (n=18)	3.84 (n=19)	3.89 (n=18)	4.11 (n=18)	3.91
Dugan	Circuit- 18 th (Brevard)	4.00 (n=13)	3.85 (n=13)	4.00 (n=12)	4.08 (n=13)	3.98
Paulk	Circuit- 18 th (Brevard)	4.11 (n=9)	4.13 (n=8)	4.25 (n=8)	4.13 (n=8)	4.15
Roberts	Circuit- 18 th (Brevard)	4.74 (n=31)	4.53 (n=30)	4.60 (n=30)	4.60 (n=30)	4.61

Turner	Circuit- 18 th (Brevard)	4.17 (n=24)	4.13 (n=23)	4.22 (n=23)	3.79 (n=24)	4.07
Baker	County- 18 th (Brevard)	4.27 (n=11)	4.30 (n=10)	4.30 (n=10)	4.10 (n=10)	4.24
Garagozlo	County- 18 th (Brevard)	4.50 (n=6)	4.43 (n=7)	4.50 (n=6)	4.50 (n=6)	4.48
Silverman	County- 18 th (Brevard)	4.33 (n=12)	4.38 (n=13)	4.33 (n=12)	4.00 (n=11)	4.26
Orfinger	Circuit- 7 th (Volusia)	4.20 (n=25)	4.08 (n=25)	4.23 (n=26)	4.24 (n=25)	4.18
Rowe	Circuit- 7 th (Volusia)	4.39 (n=18)	4.39 (n=18)	4.40 (n=20)	4.22 (n=18)	4.35
Upchurch	Circuit- 7 th (Volusia)	3.19 (n=31)	3.31 (n=32)	3.50 (n=30)	3.43 (n=30)	3.35
Kelly	County - 7 th (Volusia)	4.33 (n=6)	4.60 (n=5)	4.80 (n=5)	4.40 (n=5)	4.53
Miller	County - 7 th (Volusia)	3.50 (n=4)	3.75 (n=4)	4.20 (n=5)	4.00 (n=4)	3.86
Baxley	Circuit -5 th (Lake)	3.75 (n=8)	4.00 (n=8)	4.00 (n=8)	3.89 (n=9)	3.91
Metz	Circuit -5 th (Lake)	4.00 (n=14)	3.46 (n=13)	3.85 (n=13)	3.77 (n=13)	3.77
Singletary	Circuit -5 th (Lake)	4.17 (n=30)	4.16 (n=31)	4.37 (n=30)	4.00 (n=30)	4.17
Neal	County -5 th (Lake)	2.23 (n=13)	2.21 (n=14)	2.46 (n=13)	2.25 (n=12)	2.29

COMMENTS

Judge Alvaro

Having just been appointed, he seems to be trying hard to do a good job and the right job
I have heard good things but not appeared in front of this Judge

Judge Heather Pinder Rodriguez

Excellent across the board

Judge Keith Carsten

Judge Carsten is concerned with getting it right and he tries super hard to do so. If all judges conducted their courtrooms the way Judge Carsten does, we'd all be better off.

Very bright
Excellent judge.

Bob Leblanc

Great person. In civil it appeared that he had difficulty sticking to his rulings. I think he will be happier in criminal
Always tries to do the right thing

Judge Michael Murphy

Excellent judge

Judge Renee Roche

Great legal mind. However, Disrespectful to attorneys, even in front of their clients
Very knowledgeable can be a little moody

Judge Heather L. Higbee

Seems to base her decision on written materials provided in advance versus listening to argument
Just the best. Why couldn't she stay in civil forever?
Excellent in every respect.
Great judge. Wonderful demeanor. Patient and kind. One of our better judges

Judge Kevin B. Weiss

The best judge in the 9th Circuit. Fair; incredibly well-read and great temperament
One of the very best, hands down
Judge Weiss has a superior legal mind and runs a very efficient courtroom
Smart. Wonderful judge. Top notch
Great Judge. Pleasure to be in front of him

Judge Faye L. Allen

Consistently cannot rule consistently on any one issue causing both parties uncertainty on same issue and
wasting everyone's time because you never know which way the "wind" is blowing that day.
Excellent. Knowledgeable and kind

Judge Eric DuBois

Smart, personable; diligent. Excellent judge
I know him personally but not appeared before him. Heard good things

Judge Martha C. Adams

Patient Judge and listens to all arguments.

Judge Margaret H. Schreiber

Always polite. Good judge

Judge John D. Galluzzo

Judge Galluzzo is a great trial judge.

Judge Michael Rudisill

Excellent judge. Fair, impartial and intelligent.
Measured, smart, and a good guy.
Great judge. Patient, Kind understands his role and pleasure to try a case in front of

Judge Jessica Recksiedler

Great judge who understands the ins and outs

Judge Debra Krause

Smart, listens, and on top of it.

Judge Charles Roberts

Excellent judge - fair; personable; impartial and well-read.

In my experience, Judge Roberts easily gets hung up in the weeds by Defense counsel. He's a good guy and he's trying to do the right thing, but he constantly gets hung up in the weeds by the defense--even when the Defense asserts positions that have little or no basis in fact or law. He always tries to "split the baby" on virtually every ruling. Judges are supposed to call "balls and strikes," but in my experience Judge Roberts tries to call and ball AND a strike, somehow, on most all of his rulings. Plan on spending 90% of your trial at lengthy sidebars that end with no clear ruling one way or the other most of the time. Judge Roberts could turn all of his 5-7 day trials into 3-day trials by just using the word "Overruled" and keep things moving. I haven't had the opportunity to appear before this judge.

Charlie Roberts is hands down one of the best!

Judge David Silverman

Great judge. Very personable and intelligent.

Judge Michael Orfinger

Incredible judge.